

**Minutes
of the
Executive Assembly/Executive Steering Committee Meeting
January 14-15, 1997
Washington, DC**

AFTERNOON, JANUARY 14

The January 1997 meeting of the Executive Assembly/Executive Steering Committee was called to order by Gary Foley, EPA. Gary along with Peter Mueller, EPRI, welcomed participants and introductions of attendees proceeded. A list of attendees is attached.

Jake Hales, Management Coordinator, reviewed the agenda and noted the meeting objectives. Jake presented the criteria for success of this meeting.

Dan Albritton, NOAA, provided an overview of the relationship between NARSTO and the Subcommittee on Air Quality for the CENR (Committee on Environment and Natural Resources). Dan described how the Subcommittee is currently focusing on five major elements: ozone and ambient air pollutants, acid deposition, air toxics, indoor air, and particles and visibility. Subcommittee functions and activities include establishing research priorities, planning and coordination, and facilitating special interagency projects like external reviews and focused assessments.

Gary Foley and Peter Mueller then introduced Michelle Broido, DOE and Al Ferullo, Pennsylvania Power and Light as the new ESC Co-Chair nominees. The group then voted to confirm Michelle's and Al's nominations, as well as the nomination of Steve Cadle, General Motors as the Private Sector Co-Chair elect. Michelle will replace Gary Foley as the Public Sector Co-Chair and Al will replace Peter Mueller as the Private Sector Co-Chair. Steve Cadle will replace Al Ferullo in February 1998. The groups then met in caucus sessions to discuss their appointees to the ESC. The following represents the groups' decisions:

New Executive Steering Committee

Federal Members

1. National Oceanic & Atmospheric Administration
Daniel Albritton
2. Department of Energy
Michelle Broido (Public Sector Co-Chair)

Alternate Federal Members

- Tennessee Valley Authority
James Meagher
- Department of Interior
Mark Scruggs
- Environmental Protection Agency
Gary Foley

State Members

1. State of New Jersey Department of Environmental Protection
John Elston
2. California Air Resources Board
John Holmes

Alternate State Members

- Texas Natural Resource Conservation Commission
Cyril Durrenberger
- New York State Department of Environmental Conservation
John Cahill
- Lake Michigan Air Directors Consortium
Steve Gerritson

Utility Members

1. Pennsylvania Power and Light Company
Al Ferullo (Private Sector Co-Chair)
2. Electric Power Research Institute
Peter Mueller

Alternate Utility Members

- Northeast Utilities System
Paul Jacobson
- Ohio Edison
Fred Starheim
- United Illuminating Company
David Damer
- Public Service Electric & Gas Company
James Shissias
- GPU Service Corporation
Jeff West

Industry Members

1. American Petroleum Institute
G. William Frick
2. General Motors Corporation
Steve Cadle (Public Sector Co-Chair Elect)

Alternate Industry Members

- Dunn-Edwards Corporation
Robert Wendoll
- Ford Motor Company
David Chock

Canada Members

1. Atmospheric Environment Service
Don McKay

Alternate Canadian Members

- Atmospheric Environment Service
Maris Lusic
- Atmospheric Environment Service
Carmelita Olivotto

Mexico Members

1. To be determined

Following the caucus sessions Jake Hales presented a “state of NARSTO” overview, summarizing the progression of activities since February 1995, leading to this meeting. In his presentation Jake noted that more detailed information on NARSTO is available on the web page <http://narsto/owt.com/Narsto>. Following this, Ken Schere, Analysis and Assessment Team Co-Chair, presented a status report of NARSTO’s 1998 Assessment. This state-of-science assessment is a comprehensive review of the chemical, physical, and meteorological aspects of the tropospheric ozone issue. Seventeen Critical Review Papers on particular aspects of the science will be published in a special issue of *Atmospheric Environment*. An Assessment Report, scheduled for late 1988, will synthesize the information in the critical reviews and address how current science and tools can be applied to help resolve North American ozone management issues. This 1998 NARSTO Assessment is intended to provide pertinent information to the air-quality management community at a time when several important policy actions are scheduled.

Ron Patterson, NARSTO Associate Management Coordinator, presented a status report on two major infrastructure items. The first of these addressed planning an progress on the Quality Systems and Data Management (QS&DM) function. Under Ron's leadership a QS&DM Team has been established, and a QS&DM plan has been drafted and distributed over the NARSTO Web site. A key element of this plan is the intimate linkage of quality control with the data archiving process. Negotiations are currently in progress with NASA to provide the EOSDIS facility at NASA Langely as a repository for the NARSTO data archive. Still unresolved, however, is the question of funding the effort for data capture and ingest to the EOSDIS facility and the associated quality control efforts.

The second infrastructure item discussed by Ron involved the NARSTO oversight panel, which is intended to guide the Executive Steering Committee and the Management Coordinators on future strategy and planning, as well as to review key NARSTO documents. EPA has agreed to finance the National Academy of Sciences to constitute this committee as a component of its NARSTO infrastructure contribution, and the Academy's Ray Wassell has been selected to serve as facilitator for the effort. The Academy is currently in the process of selecting panel members for this purpose.

This session concluded with a special commendation ceremony honoring Gary Foley and Peter Mueller for their efforts as Co-Chairs of the ESC.

MORNING, JANUARY 15

Jim Vickery, EPA and Dan Albritton, NOAA chaired the first morning session, which addressed two major decision items. The first was to establish a definitive set of criteria for NARSTO Science Team Membership. During the past year some of the Science-Team Co-Chairs (especially the Assessment Team) have received an unmanageable number of requests for team membership. However, only a fraction of existing team members are participating with a high activity level. This situation has become burdensome to the Co-Chairs because of general coordination considerations, especially when mail, fax, or other communications are necessary. As a consequence the Co-Chairs have requested NARSTO adoption of criteria which limit membership to a reasonable number of truly motivated individuals. After discussion, the following proposed resolution was presented:

1. Each NARSTO member, at their option, may appoint one individual as a member of each Science Team.
2. Each appointee is expected to be an active member, participating in team meetings and reviews, and providing for their own travel and related expenses.

3. Science Team Co-Chairs, at their discretion, may appoint up to five (5) additional members from organizations outside NARSTO.
4. Team membership lists will be presented to the Executive Steering Committee/Executive Assembly annually for advice and consent.

The Executive Assembly voted to adopt the above resolution.

The second decision item of this session combined two separate but related topics. The first of these was the broad need to activate a working linkage between the Executive Assembly/ Executive Steering Committee (EA/ESC) and the Science and Resource Planning Group (S&RPG). The second was the need to fund essential NARSTO activities that are currently lacking sponsorship. The relationship between these two topics is reflected by the S&RPG's (often frustrating) experience during the past year, which has involved responsibility for implementing essential NARSTO activities, without the authority to determine funds and funding sources — a responsibility palaced on the EA/ESC under the NARSTO Charter.

It was noted that many of NARSTO's "infrastructure" functions and other cross-programmatic activities are currently being funded successfully by various NARSTO members. There are a few, however, which still need attention. Within this category, the Quality Systems and Data Management operation has remained a major unfunded NARSTO function. In addition, several more minor infrastructure functions require funding; these include Synthesis Team meeting, editing, and publishing costs for the 1998 Assessment, as well as limited travel funds for key university and private members of the NARSTO Science Teams.

A major breakthrough occurred during this session, when DOE's Martha Krebs proposed that her organization fund the QS&DM ingest operation. This DOE contribution to NARSTO's infrastructure, which will amount to several hundred thousand dollars per year, will be conducted through the auspices of Oak Ridge National Laboratory's Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center facility. Ron Patterson and his QS&DM team will plan to meet with Oak Ridge staff in the near future to plan and initialize this process and its interaction with the NASA EOS repository.

The discussion of remaining needs and associated requirements for an active EA/ESC - S&RPG interaction continued following Martha's announcement, and the following proposed resolution was presented.

1. Agree to strengthen the EA/ESC - S&RPG interaction by developing a regular meeting schedule to include:
 - One meeting of the ESC in Jan/Feb for planning for the coming fiscal year, and one follow-up meeting in June/July.
 - Two meetings of S&RPG each year, March/April to allocate funds for coming fiscal year, and Oct/Nov forming recommendations for the ESC.
 - Nov/Dec initiation of project work.
2. Agree to create a fund repository managed by a third party. Contributions are voluntary in the amount of \$10K per sponsor with credit given for direct contributions to cross-NARSTO activities.

The Executive Assembly voted to adopt the above proposed resolution, with the recommendations that 1) the exact ESC meeting dates should be chosen by the ESC with the intent of selecting the timing most appropriate with respect to established budget cycles, and 2) the S&RPG should plan one of its annual meetings so as to interface with the ESC, and thus facilitate a systematic interaction between the two groups.

In his role as Management Coordinator, Jake Hales was directed to establish appropriate pathways and repository(s) for these funds and to communicate with each NARSTO contributing member regarding these voluntary contributions.

The second morning session was chaired by Gary Foley and Peter Mueller. A presentation was given by George Hidy on the emerging fine-particle issue, as an introduction to EA/ESC consideration of questions regarding NARSTO's future aerosol-related actions, specifically those of: 1) NARSTO's inclusion of fine-particle research as a part of its purview, 2) recommending that fine-particle research be conducted under a separate but "NARSTO-like" framework, and 3) basically ignoring the fine-particle issue within the NARSTO context. This was intended to be a discussion-only topic, and no decisions were requested at this time. As a consequence of these discussions it was decided that the ESC should create a "white paper" on this issue for circulation to the EA during this coming mid-spring. Based on this, the ESC will deliver a proposal for decision at next year's EA meeting. Dan Albritton noted that the rate and pace of this decision should match the development of the topic in circles external to NARSTO, particularly within the CENR.

AFTERNOON, JANUARY 15

Michelle Broido chaired Session 5 which discussed the rotation of key NARSTO committee appointees. The following motions were voted and carried.

- No term limits will be necessary for membership on the Liaison or Stakeholder Council.
- The EA will annually review and approve or alter all appointees and chairs.
- Confirmation of recommendations to accept George Hidy's and Don Hastie's NARSTO participation, as key scientists who do not belong to NARSTO member organizations.
- NARSTO will enter a reciprocal relationship for information exchange with the EUROTRAC effort, which can be considered to be NARSTO's European counterpart. This will be implemented by appointing EUROTRAC's International Executive Secretariat (Dr. Peter Borrell of the Fraunhofer Institute) as an official member of NARSTO's Liaison Team. Jake Hales, Management Coordinator, will provide similar NARSTO representation to Eurotrac. It has been agreed that all travel and other expenses associated with this activity be paid by the representatives, eliminating the need for exchange of monies between the two parties.