

Appendix II – d. Summary of interview responses to Charge #2

2) Assess NARSTO’s distinctive capabilities and their value to NARSTO’s constituencies.			
Each row below corresponds to the comments of a particular interviewee whose names have been redacted			
Distinctive Capabilities	Value		
	Governments	Industry	Other
<p>Quality and usefulness of products depend on who participates.</p> <p>Makes people more aware of what is happening in other countries</p> <p>Employs a weight of evidence approach.</p>	<p>Useful to Govts. to have wide participation.</p> <p>Important to Government objectivity.</p>	<p>Important to Industry</p> <p>Favored by Industry.</p>	
<p>It has helped focus multinational research activities on the most policy relevant science questions and has continually provided an authoritative review of research priorities.</p> <p>NARSTO is unique in its inclusion of academia, the private sector and Mexican counterparts, and in its direct focus on policy information needs.</p> <p>The unique make-up of NARSTO membership broadens the perspective on research priorities and provides fruitful opportunities to collaborate with groups and individuals outside our usual institutional, disciplinary, and geographic spheres.</p> <p>NARSTO has been a very cost-efficient organization</p>	<p>Very valuable.</p>	<p>Important.</p>	
<p>NARSTO is tri-lateral and therefore taken more seriously.</p> <p>Value of the assessments has been in the participation of experts - where their own participation is valuable to them.</p> <p>NARSTO tri-lateral membership means that it has been useful in coordinating trans-boundary assessments. The NGO/industry</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>It is uniquely capable because it is not constrained by government agendas.</p>	<p>The NGO/industry participation adds value and weight. .</p>

2) Assess NARSTO’s distinctive capabilities and their value to NARSTO’s constituencies.			
Each row below corresponds to the comments of a particular interviewee whose names have been redacted			
Distinctive Capabilities	Value		
	Governments	Industry	Other
<p>participation adds value and weight. Ideally, the addition of NGOs and industry from Canada and Mexico would be a good addition to the organization.</p> <p>NARSTO can bridge gaps among different viewpoints and agencies.</p>			
<p>NARSTO provides a unique opportunity to build public-private partnerships among federal/state-provincial governments and with industry and academia – and to jointly assess science.</p> <p>There are no other models like this.</p> <p>NARSTO has put together science laid out in an objective form.</p> <p>NARSTO has contributed to uniform implementation. For instance – in relation to reactivity.</p> <p>Collaborative effort gives you more than the sum of the parts.</p>	<p>Yes</p> <p>NARSTO is valuable for countries to use.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Yes</p> <p>A neutral party was needed to achieve agreement on how to assess reactivity through chambers and other techniques – to measure benefit.</p>
<p>It is a three country effort.</p> <p>Focuses on science.</p> <p>Exchanges information in a non-adversarial manner.</p> <p>Pulls together information from different sources.</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>Yes</p>
<p>There is a continuing need for a collaborative research mechanism, such as HEI or NARSTO, which conducts policy-relevant research and presents results in policy-neutral terms.</p> <p>NARSTO does have an efficient and unique structure that would be difficult or impossible to recreate. Its operations are open to any and all interested participants and are completely transparent. The data archive is also unique and serves a valuable and continuing function.</p>		<p>Yes</p>	

2) Assess NARSTO’s distinctive capabilities and their value to NARSTO’s constituencies.			
Each row below corresponds to the comments of a particular interviewee whose names have been redacted			
Distinctive Capabilities	Value		
	Governments	Industry	Other
Continued interaction with Industry organizations may be the best way to engage industry, although future industry participation is likely to be very issue-specific.			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NARSTO has also produced added value for the US as far as DOE is concerned. • NARSTO has successfully highlighted the ecological benefits of the management of air emissions. • NARSTO has successfully engaged Canadian and Mexican interests. • NARSTO has the right people engaged in every place of interest and focus. • NARSTO has connectivity in North America in science as well as policy. 	Yes	Yes	Yes
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Collaboration of (multi-agency) government, industry and academic communities is valuable, but not entirely unique (HEI has similar multi-sector participation). • The multi-national aspect of NARSTO organization provides unique and valuable opportunities for collaboration that are not otherwise available. 	Yes	Yes	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Outside, expertise and insight were very useful and helpful. • Mexican air quality monitoring and emissions inventories are way behind those in the US and Canada. • NARSTO membership has helped Mexico see where to go and how to get there. Compared to the CEC, NARSTO is more focused and has technical expertise that CEC does not have. • Brings together very knowledgeable people in air quality management. The expertise does not exist in any other tri-national group. 	High Value		

2) Assess NARSTO’s distinctive capabilities and their value to NARSTO’s constituencies.			
Each row below corresponds to the comments of a particular interviewee whose names have been redacted			
Distinctive Capabilities	Value		
	Governments	Industry	Other
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The only interest/focus is in improving air quality. Very impressed by the quality of the individuals and their dedication to the task of setting high quality “bench marks”. It is what makes it work. Leadership by example. 			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The site contains between 100 and 125 data sets with over 1000 files. One of our objectives is to ensure that the data is in a form/format that is standardized and people know what to expect when they access the data. Historically NARSTO has brought a widely diverse group of people together. Participants are from three countries, universities, industries and governments. 	Yes (10 to 15 % of the requests for data come from the governments sector.)		For those who know the value of high quality data this is of great value.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> NARSTO brings a critical and diverse mass of expertise to the discussion. It would not happen otherwise. The other mechanism for ensuring similar participation is the National Academy of Sciences, NAS, but it is much more formal and costly. NARSTO is an important resource without as much formality as the NAS. It is a “community of interest” that includes experts from EPA and thus NARSTO has been able to focus on topics of great importance and timely utility. In contrast, NAS committees cannot include EPA or other federal agency experts. In summary NARSTO is flexible, non-bureaucratic and more cost effective. 			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no other place to get the perspective offered by NARSTO. Representatives from the three countries get together with participation from the federal, state, provincial, private and academic levels. NAFTA and the CEC and the Canada-U.S Air Quality 	Yes		

2) Assess NARSTO’s distinctive capabilities and their value to NARSTO’s constituencies.			
Each row below corresponds to the comments of a particular interviewee whose names have been redacted			
Distinctive Capabilities	Value		
	Governments	Industry	Other
Agreement do not offer similar broad and as fully engaged perspectives. In particular, NARSTO is tri-lateral and focuses on much more than emissions and has academic as well as industry and government members.			
I do not think that there is any other organization where you have people from all 3 countries coming together.			